UNITED
NATIONS

A

General Assembly

Distr.
GENERAL

A/50/330
4 August 1995

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

Fiftieth session
Item 97 (g) of the provisional agenda*

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT AND INTERNATIONAL ECONOMIC COOPERATION:
HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT

Developing human resources for development

Report of the Secretary-General

I. INTRODUCTION

1. The present report is submitted to the General Assembly in response to resolution 48/205 of 21 December 1993 on developing human resources for development. In that resolution the Assembly requested the Secretary-General to continue to monitor the activities of the United Nations system in human resource development, and to submit to it at its fiftieth session a report on the implementation of resolution 48/205, including further action taken to enhance inter-agency coordination within the United Nations system with regard to human resource development and bearing in mind the definition of human resource development presented in resolutions 44/213 of 22 December 1989, 45/191 of 21 December 1990 and 46/143 of 17 December 1991. It also requested the Secretary-General to take into account the important role of human resource development in the elaboration of an agenda for development. The present report is the fourth in the series of reports under the same title submitted to the Assembly at its forty-fifth, forty-sixth and forty-eighth sessions (see A/45/451, A/46/461 and A/48/364).

2. In resolution 48/205 the General Assembly reaffirmed that people are central to all developmental activities and that human resource development is an essential means of achieving sustainable development goals, and emphasized that, in the development of human resources, an overall, well-conceived

* A/50/150.

95-23303 (E) 290895 300895

/...

and integrated approach that is sensitive to gender considerations should be adopted, incorporating such vital areas as population, health, nutrition, water, sanitation, housing, communications, education and training, science and technology, and employment. In addition, important emphasis has been placed on the special needs of women and youth, and the necessity for an enabling socio-economic environment that guarantees opportunities for political freedom, popular participation, respect for human rights, justice and equity. The Assembly also noted the importance of the role that non-governmental organizations can play in human resource development.

3. Highlighting the importance of country efforts in human resource development and the need for the United Nations system to make that area a priority in its support to countries, the General Assembly requested the Secretary-General to monitor and report on the relevant activities of the United Nations system in that regard, and requested information on further action taken to enhance inter-agency coordination within the United Nations system for human resource development.

4. Clearly, the Assembly recognized the mutualities among the sectoral components of human resource development and the consequent requirement for more integrated strategies. The World Summit for Social Development, convened pursuant to General Assembly resolution 47/92, together with the agenda for development proposed initially by the Secretary-General in May 1994 (see A/48/935), have given new prominence to both the imperative for an increased priority for human resource development within the United Nations development community and the necessity for an integrated approach to human resource development.

5. Consequently, the present report extends the discussion presented in the previous reports of the Secretary-General with a review in chapter II of human resource development problems as well as recent contextual and definitional issues, particularly in the light of the World Summit, that both constrain and enable an enhanced emphasis on integrated human resource development implementation. Support by the regional commissions and agencies of the United Nations system to integrated human resource development initiatives at the regional and country levels are outlined in chapters IV and V, with additional examples drawn from regional and country-level operational activities conducted in cooperation with United Nations system partners. In deference to the importance of the World Summit in signalling international commitments to social development, a brief review of implications for human resource development is included in chapter VI. Finally, chapter VII presents conclusions and offers recommendations for the future.

6. The present report has been prepared on the basis of information and contributions provided by United Nations funding and programme agencies and regional commissions, and from reports and publications of the relevant United Nations specialized agencies, national data sources and academic studies.

II. STATUS OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT: THE CONCEPT, CONSTRAINTS AND DEFINITIONS

A. The concept

7. Awesome challenges face Governments today in terms of changing demographics, resource scarcity, the increasing complexity of socio-economic interactions, globalization and pressures for increased participation by people in all aspects of national decision-making. Investments in human resources are key to development, but responsibilities for such investments rest uneasily across multiple sectors and inside and outside government. Concepts of human resource development are changing and moving towards closer interaction and policy coordination between sectors. International endorsements of these trends are visible in the documentation of the World Summit. Despite conspicuous progress in some areas, problems in most relevant sectors are in many cases worsening, and are reviewed briefly in order to provide an update since the last human resource development report. In the light of these overall contextual factors, the definition of human resource development is provided as the basis for exploration of country and United Nations system efforts at improving human resource development policies and practices world wide.

8. With some notable exceptions, development over the last 15 years in the less industrialized and poorer countries has not proceeded in ways that have permitted those countries to become either more economically competitive in world markets or more socially cohesive. Furthermore, many industrialized countries of the North have experienced rising unemployment rates, inequitable resource distribution and unanticipated increases in poverty even as their economies were pronounced sound and their gross national product (GNP) continued to rise. Profound and unprecedented changes are taking place in the socio-economic environment of all nations, through enhanced communication, potential globalization of much of human enterprise, increasingly competitive markets for goods and services and rapid electronic transformation. Consequently, re-emphasis on social infrastructure, and on "social capital" 1/ is now seen as indispensable for avoiding the pervasive cycle of economic decline, increasing poverty and environmental degradation from which many countries are now struggling to escape.

9. In the past, investments in human resources, primarily through education and training have been seen as generating human capital for economic growth, in the form of attributes, capabilities, competencies and experience that people draw on in order to live their lives productively. In the face of reservations, 2/ the earlier, more centralized governmental approaches drawing extensively on national manpower planning are giving way to more decentralized and participatory strategies that emphasize human "resourcefulness" and seek to integrate human resource development elements across many sectors.

10. The current concept of more integrated human resource development has emerged over the last three decades partly in response to dissatisfaction with earlier methods. 3/ Human capital-based and manpower planning approaches of the past often referred to the "human resource" in the abstract without an "s", and as a consequence, human resource development and utilization have therefore been characterized as instrumental, and primarily oriented towards improving the

means towards economic growth. 4/ Traditional neo-classical theories of economic growth proposed ways to measure the contribution of different factors of production, one of which was labour. Numbers and skill levels of manpower were thus an important element in productivity growth, perceived as a necessary condition for socio-economic progress. Manpower planning consequently became a central plank in development planning. Countries have since sought to move beyond the instrumentality and simple quantification of those approaches to broader and less restrictive methodologies.

11. Accordingly, the focus of human resource development in the present report is on fostering the contributory capacities that human beings bring to the improvement of their own quality of life and that of others in their families, communities, enterprises and societies. Comprehensive strategies for the development of such human resourcefulness include policies and programmes that promote the acquisition and application of knowledge and skills in ways that are mutually beneficial to individuals and the social groupings of which they are a part.

12. The term human resource development has had various definitions over the years and since the 1960s it has had several (and often overlapping) categories of policy usage: in addition to "human capital" formation and related outgrowth of neo-classical economic factor theories of production and input/output models, the term has referred to remedial strategies with a "basic needs" connotation for those perceived to be at some disadvantage in access to education, health services or employment; personnel administration in large formal sector enterprises or agencies in either the public or private sector; and, increasingly, intersectoral and interactive policies and programmes (as outlined in A/48/364) that foster, promote and sustain human resourcefulness at the individual, group and/or institutional levels. Each of these approaches have provided conceptual and pragmatic structure to some of the most difficult and intractable problems of our age. It is clear, however, that the definitions of human resource development are still evolving as a function of renewed attention to these issues in view of their continuing importance. Moreover, any definition must be operable within specific country contexts and will likely therefore need to be refined and targeted to each country's own priorities. The way forward in conceptualizing human resource development for the future is signalled in resolution 48/205 and the documentation of the World Summit for Social Development, but must also rest on research, analytical judgements and policy evaluation acquired from prior and ongoing experience with the applications summarized here. In particular, the emphasis of the World Summit must be maintained on people-centred and sustainable development, empowerment and new partnerships between government and civil society.

13. A recent commentary on the United Nations capacity to respond to global needs has noted the intersectorality of solutions to problems that "cannot in real life be neatly compartmentalized": 5/

> "You cannot isolate farm production from roads, transport and the availability of market outlets; or treat environmental degradation without considering population pressures and energy needs ... or make much impression on illiteracy where there are too few opportunities to use the

skills acquired. A fragmented approach to problems that are essentially interlinked tends to be ultimately destructive."

14. Interventions in one sector usually have an effect on another sector. One example of such an impact is the education of women, which has many long-term, cross-sectoral social benefits and high rates of return. The strategic planning of human resource policy should encompass as far as possible all relevant sectors as well as close articulation with the macroeconomic context in which the policy operates. This is particularly important in situations where resources are scarce and where Governments are under pressure to extract the maximum positive impact per unit of expenditure.

15. This emerging approach to human resource development goes beyond the largely sectoral remedies of the past and requires intersectoral linkages to be explicitly addressed. Implementation therefore necessitates a more integrated and multidisciplinary framework within which human resource development decisions are taken, bridging traditional sectors and reaching new actors. It aims to extend beyond human resource supply (education, training) to incorporate also factors relating to the demand for human resources and the necessary supportive context within which people can continually maximize their choices for acquiring, applying or updating their knowledge and skills.

16. Analyses of earlier human resource development resolutions have documented the evolutionary nature of the General Assembly's definitions of human resource development through successive statements. Among the elements fundamental to the current concept are the following (see resolution 48/205):

(a) Basic education and demand-oriented skill development (in particular for young people, and most especially for young women) with appropriate technological advancement of methods where possible (e.g. for distance learning to remote areas) to broaden applications;

(b) National human resource capacity-building as a key factor in socio-economic progress;

(c) A well conceived, integrated and gender-sensitive approach to human resource development, incorporating other vital sectors such as population, health, housing, technology and employment within a context of political freedom, popular participation and respect for human rights, and with due recognition of the potential role of non-governmental organizations;

(d) Cooperation between all key constituencies (e.g. public/non-governmental/private sectors, North/South, South/South and the United Nations system);

(e) Increased financial resources flows to human resource development;

(f) Target setting for multi-sectoral human resource development approaches;

(g) Mitigation where necessary of the negative effects of structural adjustment.

17. In presenting the report of the Secretary-General (A/48/364) to the Second Committee on 20 October 1993, the representative of the Department for Economic and Social Information and Policy Analysis recalled that in deciding to convene the World Summit for Social Development, the General Assembly had recognized that human resource development constituted the main determinant of the development process. The United Nations system can, through such mechanisms as the resident coordinator system, country strategy notes, the programme approach and more focused and coordinated operational activities, assist countries in building their own capacity for improving their human resource development policies and programmes.

18. Major conclusions of the report included emphasis on United Nations system coordination in assisting countries to foster development of their human resources, especially among the most vulnerable; the need for agreement on appropriate social indicators for measuring progress in human resource development; better articulation of sectoral human resource development approaches into integrated national strategies; and prioritization for human resource development in social expenditures and mobilization of new resources.

19. Reactions to the report were widely representative of world regions and of nations at various stages of development, and were uniformly supportive of the more integrated concepts proposed. A consensus was evident around the importance of equitable access to human resource development opportunities for all, and around the need for respecting key national differences in specific aspects of human resource development interventions.

20. Human resource development strategies are crucial to development, but to be effective they must be specifically crafted to each national-to-local continuum of needs and adequately reflective of the complexity and interactive influences of multiple factors in many sectors. Links between economic and social factors of development are essential and those links will include international as well as intra-national elements. An enabling environment can facilitate country human resource development programmes, including international support and consideration of influences beyond a country's individual control, implying a need for better understanding of international responsibilities in that regard.

21. An important factor, however, which has continued to emerge in international forums such as the World Summit for Social Development, is the extent to which human resource development concerns are shared in both the economically advantaged and disadvantaged countries. Poverty, illiteracy, underemployment and unemployment are not problems of the South exclusively. Those charged with defining human resource development policy or carrying out specific human resource development programmes at the grass-roots levels can surely benefit from information exchange both ways across the North-South spectrum. The United Nations system, with its specialized agency experience and expertise and its capacity to tap into the most experienced and creative of the world's human resources from the South as well as the North, has much to offer in supporting such information interchange.

B. Constraints

22. Since the completion of the previous report of the Secretary-General (A/48/364), extensive research and discussion has centred around the problems in the social sectors of most countries. In a statement made on 11 October 1993 to the Second Committee of the General Assembly emphasizing preventive rather than curative development, the Administrator of the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) described the world as a "disaster machine", generating crises "with distressing regularity ... famines, ethnic and other conflicts, floods of refugees, extreme social disintegration, environmental disasters, and even failed States. Dealing with these ... is expensive, sometimes bloody, and in human terms, invariably late ... Behind [such] recurring crises lie mass poverty and human deprivation, unprecedented inequalities ... and chronic environmental decline. These threats to security are the urgent development challenge of today."

23. Threats to fundamental social order are by no means confined to the newer, or poorer nations, or to the nations of the South. It has been said that in some of the most "developed" societies, social disease formations are going beyond human control. 6/ Even wealthy countries are now attempting to document and index their own "exploding social pathologies". Alarm at decaying social fabrics is thus global in its scope.

24. As pools of available information and knowledge expand to the margins of human capacity to comprehend and as technological innovation accelerates, social and psychological support structures are hard pressed to keep up. Traditional hierarchical social patterns, for example, where the young deferred to the authority of older family members and of institutions, are breaking down. Cultural patterns that bind people into supportive webs of mutual dependency are being eroded as individual-centred interests gradually undermine systems of kinship.

25. Such disturbing trends in the social infrastructures of nations paint only one part of the overall picture and must be placed in the context of many positive indicators. The spread of democracy, new markets and the assertion of individuals' rights to determine their own destinies are fostered by salient improvements in quality of life in many countries. There is clearly a growing insistence on deeper involvement and participation by people in the events and processes that shape their lives. As the succession of UNDP Human Development Reports has shown, however, adapting governance structures and approaches to accommodate those new forces for social change is a complex and difficult undertaking, especially in view of the depth of the sectoral problems across the spectrum of development in different regions of the world.

26. Gaps between more and less developed countries continue to widen, reflecting the marginalization of developing countries in respect of the main determinants of international trade, money, finance, technology and information and communication flows. Currently more than one billion people in the world live in abject poverty and more than half go hungry every day. A large proportion of men and women, particularly in Africa and the least developed countries, have very limited or no access to income and resources. As emphasized by the UNICEF The State of the World's Children - 1995, among the

most vulnerable of those living in poverty are children, who have little power to affect their situation and whose future livelihoods may be permanently threatened by deprivation in their early years.

27. Internationally, according to UNDP Human Development Reports, the poorest 40 or 50 countries have seen their share of world income decline to the point where a fifth of the world's people now share less that 1.5 per cent of world income. Within individual nations, developing or industrialized, the poorest sections of the community are also being marginalized: in the 44 developing nations and 20 industrialized countries for which figures are available, the poorest fifth now share, on average, little more than 5 per cent of national income, while the richest fifth claim between 40 per cent and 60 per cent. In the last 10 years, in particular, falling commodity prices, rising military expenditures, poor returns on investment, the debt crisis and structural adjustment programmes have reduced the real incomes of approximately 800 million people in some 40 developing countries. In Latin America, the fall in incomes has been as much as 20 per cent. In sub-Saharan Africa it has often been more. 7/

28. Over 120 million people worldwide are officially unemployed and many more remain underemployed. Too many young people just starting their productive lives, even including those with formal education, see little hope of finding productive work. Notwithstanding stronger growth in some developed countries, unemployment rates remain alarmingly and persistently high.

29. Close to 6 million persons join the labour force each year throughout Africa, which is the only continent where the 15-24 year age group is projected to continue to grow over the next 30 years. 8/ Unemployment even among university graduates is on the increase, as it is also in other regions. The young are almost three times as likely to be unemployed as workers older than 25 and young females are the most adversely affected, with unemployment rates estimated at twice that of their male counterparts. Many interacting forces thus contribute to serious social alienation, disillusionment and endemic hopelessness all too early in the lives of young people.

30. The industrialized countries of Europe have not been immune to the effects of unemployment as larger and larger numbers of workers have found themselves excluded from the labour market. In most industrialized countries unemployment has risen steadily since 1973 and the average level in the countries of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) is now around 10 per cent, with rates over this common in eastern and central Europe. 9/ In economies in transition, in particular in eastern Europe and central Asia, unemployment has been sudden and pervasive, with substantially increased inequality and poverty, even among the relatively educated and skilled. Loss of access to various forms of social transfer payments has generated a particularly difficult and interlinked set of problems for human resource development strategies. Older and previously employed persons have been forced precipitously out of the labour force. Young people also have been "drifting into poverty through prolonged non-access to jobs". 10/

31. The ILO 1995 World Employment Report points out that while the last few decades have seen a steady growth in world output, in international trade and in

flows of foreign direct investment, the differences in the position of different countries and of different social groups within those countries continue to raise serious adjustment and distributional issues. The brain drain from poorer countries to situations where rewards are higher for scholarship and achievement is a strong inhibitor to development in the former countries.

32. In its 1993 Human Development Report, UNDP noted the prevalence of jobless growth, a phenomenon now strongly affecting but by no means limited to industrialized countries. Less than 33 per cent of increase in output between 1960 and 1987 in developing countries resulted from increased labour. More than two thirds came from investment in capital. Employment has thus consistently lagged behind economic growth, with a corresponding extension of informal sector activities in urban areas. Research on informal sector workers in both Africa and Asia has shown, however, that their average ages are in the high twenties or early thirties, raising considerable doubt about the subsector's capacity to provide even marginal employment for young labour force entrants.

33. In the job market women earn less and hold fewer professional positions than men. Thus, fewer than 20 per cent of women in south and west Asia are economically active compared with nearly 40 per cent in east and south-east Asia. Throughout the world, a woman may earn anywhere from 50 to 92 cents to every dollar earned by a man. In developing countries, women hold 8 per cent of the administrative and managerial positions compared to 24 per cent in the industrialized world. In sub-Saharan Africa, 80 per cent of economically active women work in agriculture; in south Asia the figure is 60 per cent; in east and south-east Asia 50 per cent; in North America 40 per cent; in west Asia 30 per cent; in Latin America, the Caribbean and in developed regions 10 per cent. 11/ Indicators are considered less than minimal, and still very far from the levels of available data on men.

34. The unstable international socio-economic climate is drawing world attention to issues not only of demand for, but also supply of human resources. UNESCO has estimated the number of illiterate adults globally to have been reduced throughout the 1980s (from 9.5 million to 9.05 million). 12/ Although there are wide disparities across regions, absolute numbers enrolled in formal education at all levels have generally risen between 10 per cent (primary) and around 20 per cent (secondary and tertiary) for developing countries during the period from 1970 to 1990, but persistently high repeater and drop-out rates in many countries, especially at the primary level and especially among young girls, continue to widen knowledge and skills gaps. Furthermore, there is increasing evidence, according to the International Labour Organization (ILO) of graduate unemployment in both North and South as one of the many elements contributing to world-wide unemployment levels. 13/

35. According to UNESCO, in some countries, gross enrolment ratios at the primary level fell from 1980 to 1990 by as much as 20 per cent or more. 14/ While the majority of countries experiencing these declines are in Africa, some south Asian countries are also included. School enrolments are not keeping up with population growth, and females are particularly affected. More than half of the 16 African countries reporting expected years of formal schooling in 1990 for children of school age indicated less than six years. The highest numbers reported worldwide were over 13 years in Asia, and more than 15 years in Europe

and North America, underscoring what UNESCO calls the widening global "knowledge gap".

36. Although roughly equal enrolment rates are now common in various levels of schooling in Latin America and the Caribbean, marked gender disparities still exist in sub-Saharan Africa and southern Asia. In sub-Saharan African countries there are approximately 60 girls enrolled at the second level (age 10-12) for every 100 boys. In south Asia the situation is even worse, with 40 girls being enrolled for every 100 boys. Early child-bearing is one reason for this disparity and holds further implications for women's future reproductive and productive roles. Productive roles are affected by lower literacy rates. Seventy-five per cent of women aged 25 and over in northern and sub-Saharan Africa, West Asia (excluding Cyprus, Israel, South Africa and Turkey) and southern Asia are illiterate. University enrolment is seeing gains for women. Indeed, in 33 developed and developing countries, primarily in Latin America, the Caribbean, some west Asian countries, women's enrolment is higher than men's. In Africa, Lesotho is the only country in which this phenomenon has occurred, otherwise the region's average is only 30 women per 100 men in sub-Saharan Africa and 51 per 100 men in northern Africa. 15/

37. Women's health is another area of great concern in both developed and developing nations. Both biological and social factors can be threats to women's health. Birth and pregnancy-related complications still account for a maternal mortality rate 80 to 600 times higher for women in developing countries than in developed countries. Poor women in some developed countries also face a higher risk than those with the means for private care. Reasons include absence of trained personnel, malnutrition, and lack of services for high-risk pregnancies.

38. AIDS and other sexually transmitted diseases also have an impact on women's productive and reproductive lives. Over a third of those infected with AIDS worldwide are women. Africa in particular has been hard hit by the epidemic. WHO reports that AIDS is now the leading cause of death for women aged 20-40 in some major European cities, sub-Saharan Africa and the Americas. 16/

39. Other health threats are not biological but come from inherent social inequalities faced by women. Abusive relationships where women have no recourse to the law or are economically bound to the abusive partner and other forms of domestic violence, rape, incest, murder within the family and infanticide, among others, are potential risks faced by all of the world's women. Women are more likely to be sexually assaulted than men and data from the Caribbean region show the number of men charged with rape rose 134 per cent from 1970 to 1980. 17/

40. Rising levels of homicide and crime particularly in large urban areas are documented in the 1993 United Nations Report on the World Social Situation for industrialized as well as developing countries. 18/ The incidence of depression, substance abuse and suicide is growing among the young, most notably in developed market economy countries, although small island societies are also experiencing increased prevalence of reported rape, teenage pregnancy, sexually transmitted diseases and suicide.

41. High levels of violence appear to be increasingly either observed or directly experienced by the young. Civil and intra-State wars have menaced civilians in unprecedented numbers, since warfare has extended beyond armed conflict between military combatants to permeate whole societies. Over the past century, the percentage of total war casualties accounted for by civilian deaths has leapt from 10 per cent to close to 90 per cent in 1990. 19/

C. Definition

42. The foregoing illustrates the extent and seriousness of social, environmental and economic problems facing communities, Governments and international organizations today. Furthermore, poverty travels and is not respectful of national boundaries. Solutions have to be found that are sensitive to the demands across as well as within sectors, promoting not only environmentally sound development but taking the next step of ensuring full consistency between all three major development concerns - economic growth, environmental preservation and regeneration, and social development.

43. The continuum of United Nations global events, such as the conference on primary health care held at Alma-Aty, the International Conference on Nutrition, and the meetings held at Jomtien, Thailand, (basic learning), Rio de Janeiro, Brazil (environment and development), Cairo (population and development, and especially women's education), Copenhagen (eradication of poverty, full employment, social integration) and Beijing (empowerment of women) has underscored the crucial interrelationships between the different dimensions of development. In particular, the complex social challenges of the 1990s, as detailed in the preparatory process for Copenhagen, can no longer be addressed by exclusively sectoral solutions.

44. Although the World Summit for Social Development, held at Copenhagen, notably shifted the focus of the United Nations system towards social aspects of development, the importance of sustained economic growth for effective development is still explicitly acknowledged. Successful human resource development strategies are clearly dependent on better understanding of the interface between social and economic factors, as well as on better articulation of those strategies across the different social sectors. The 1994 World Development Report of the World Bank has documented substantial intra-national differences in performance between key infrastructural sectors critical to sustaining social development. 20/ The "human" aspects of sustained economic development are now considered central to successful social progress as specified in the documentation surrounding the preparation for, and completion of the World Summit.

45. Emerging from the Summit's Programme of Action as well as the discussion surrounding the agenda for development (see A/48/935) is the implication that relationships between how people prepare for, and then conduct their chosen livelihoods in socially and economically useful and productive ways are pivotal to social development. In the past, and for those with adequate opportunity for the appropriate choices, there has tended to be a prescriptive, roughly linear and sequential individual progress from school to the workplace. Initial exposure to more or less formal (or informal) education was assumed to be then

followed by entry to the labour market, finding a job and subsequent on-the-job learning and maturation and adaptation throughout a socio-economically productive life.

46. These assumptions are now threatened. While education has generally been associated in parent's minds with expectations of better jobs for their children, the phenomenon is now widespread of young, well educated unemployed in many countries in both the North as well as the South. Rising formal sector unemployment, and growing "informalization" of urban economies are making these issues more politically visible, while placing new constraints on human resource development approaches of the past. Moreover, as indicated earlier, in the South, extension of educational opportunity even at primary levels has often been unable to ensure preservation of adequate quality. Mean years of schooling for persons 15 years and over in all developing countries is calculated at less than 4 years at the outset of the 1990s. 21/ This statistic says little about quality, but even so primary education is the only exposure to the educational system that many will experience.

47. In terms of public policy, therefore, human resource development approaches that have focused largely on supply-side institutions responsible for shaping skills and providing access to knowledge bases (i.e. formal education and training), with less regard to occupational demand for the eventual "product", have been giving way gradually to more sensitive and demand-oriented understanding of the changes in the human resource environment. In the face of swiftly changing livelihood constraints, traditional insistence on timebound skills and knowledge of currently proscribed information domains is being complemented by emphasis on the ability to learn, to access information, and to make critical judgements relating to entirely new information. This principle, while not new, is emerging more strongly from primary school to university. Thus, "education in a modern society" calls for the establishment of an "access relationship" with knowledge. 22/

48. Articulation between (a) preparation for employment and livelihoods, and (b) the nature of the livelihoods to be expected, is at the basis of effective human resource development strategy. Human resource development policies that concentrate on supply-side improvements unrelated to demand (e.g. increasing access without attention to quality/relevance) thus run the risk of further separation between education or training on the one hand and, on the other, the ultimate goal of productive socio-economic activities towards which improved knowledge and skills are purportedly directed. Lack of correspondence between education offerings and the demands of both formal and informal labour markets presents a major problem for both supply- and demand-side institutions. As a consequence, in response to immediate and short-term needs, more ad hoc and targeted training programmes become essential. Training, however, is often relatively expensive on a per capita basis and numbers trained in the poorer countries may only be a small fraction of the number needing training.

49. In a turbulent economic and technological environment, formal sector employers resist investing in employee training in the face of the heightened occupational mobility potential of those trained. This may be the case with public sector employing agencies/ministries who look to external support for "capacity-building" of employees only to find that participants in such skill

development leave for more lucrative private sector employment once they have completed their training. Again, private sector employers demonstrate their reluctance to invest in costly management skill development training of executives if lateral mobility to a competitor may result. Consequently, public sector policy can serve to facilitate and support individual and private decision-making and assist in "smoothing" inequities in access to and utilization of human resource development opportunities.

50. Despite the increasing complexities of the supply/demand relationships facing human resource development practitioners, closer correspondence is essential between these two domains. The present report therefore carries forward the broader definition of human resource development with its foundations in lifelong learning and adaptability for employment and sustainable livelihoods, and its objectives of fostering the development of human resourcefulness through a more integrated and supportive web of mutually reinforcing strategies at the country level.

51. Integrated strategies for human resource development rest on the five building blocks put forward in the previous report, with the purpose of empowering people through:

(a) Promotion of equitable opportunities for lifelong acquisition of knowledge, skills and competencies necessary for performance of chosen roles that contribute economically and/or socially to self and others, with emphasis on developing abilities to learn;

(b) Facilitating application of knowledge/skills/competencies in ways that are mutually useful to the individual and their immediate social and/or economic grouping; such activities may include compensated or uncompensated work, but may also include other ways of sustaining all aspects of livelihoods that reflect the contributory capacity of the individual, such that mixed strategies (e.g. farm and non-farm activities, self-employment, part-time home-based occupational activities or volunteer service) are seen along with traditional "work" as providing human value-added to the community or society;

(c) Improving access to fundamental assets (such as land, shelter, basic health, capital, information) without which any human being is restricted from performing optimally;

(d) Sustenance of human resources through the necessary statutory, regulatory, legislative and participatory governance mechanisms that express the ongoing social will to support human resource development;

(e) Ensuring the backstopping of essential human freedoms such as acceptably peaceful and equitable political, economic and social environments that promote individual, local and national security.

52. Implicit in this comprehensive definition are (a) psychological dimensions of individual differences/disabilities in maturation and human development in specific sociocultural settings; this aspect of human resource development is often not sufficiently demarcated in aggregated considerations of "the human resource"; (b) the role of public policy in facilitating and promoting the

development and application of these contributory capacities in measurable ways; and (c) flexibility of the human resource development concept to permit various interpretations both in terms of levels and types of system (national/local; governmental/non-governmental; firm/sector; industrialized/less industrialized).

III. PROGRESS MADE BY DEVELOPING COUNTRIES IN PURSUIT OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT AT THE NATIONAL LEVEL

53. At the level of national structures, human resource development policy and strategies of necessity have always involved a wide spectrum of governmental and non-governmental actors. The most central of these, on the human resource supply side, have been education, health, labour/industrial development ministries (with the addition of agriculture ministries conducting substantial training in the less developed countries). On the demand side are the labour, industrial, commercial and technological ministries, public and private sector employing establishments, and other key policy actors such as employers' associations and workers' organizations.

54. Much intersectoral liaison has traditionally taken place in the past, for example, in vocational education and training, between specified sub-elements (e.g. directorates within education and labour ministries). Genuinely intersectoral policies and strategies for facilitating the equitable development of the country's entire human resources, however, are harder to find. Yet there seems to be a renewed call for much greater integration between the various actors in these strategies. Countries in both the North (e.g. Canada) and South (Ethiopia) are currently experimenting with major new initiatives in more coordinated human resource development policies. Other countries such as India have been pioneering many aspects of integrating human resource development services for many years.

55. In particular, better understanding is beginning to emerge of linkages between the supply process on the one hand (population, education, health), and the diverse and dynamic activity of fluctuating demand for human resources (in public and private sector employing establishments, as well as self-employment and a growing variety of less formal ways of making a living) on the other. Collaboration can be quite minimalist and although in some cases it may involve strengthening of national planning capacity, it does not imply centralized planning, new structures, excessively formal interaction or the merging of existing institutions. The focus can be on major priorities for enhanced coordination, such as improved nutritional status of schoolchildren (education/health) or better information on available jobs for individual occupational choice or educational planning (education/labour).

56. The goal is more efficient and effective service delivery at the district and community level, with special emphasis on inclusion of vulnerable groups. Both the "vertical" articulation from local level up to national (e.g. school districts to national ministries of education), and the formal interactions "horizontally" between various elements of service delivery (e.g. local education authorities, public health infrastructures, non-governmental organizations and civil society organizations) at each level are fundamental to a well integrated human resource development structure and process.

57. There is of course no international "template" for human resource development that is applicable to all country conditions. Not only are the dynamics of human resource supply and demand different in each country, but even within countries, local and urban/rural patterns vary and may change swiftly over time. Technological change, industrial development and other factors (e.g. regional trade agreements) alter human resource requirements almost overnight in the fast-paced context of modernization. Each country can however improve its methodologies, structures and processes for human resource development, and particularly their integration and coordination in specific ways.

58. Effective integrated strategies must give consideration to the socio-economic context within which each country must define its own approaches to human resource development - the "enabling environment" as defined in the Copenhagen Programme of Action. Three major levels are evident at which intersectoral relationships influence the implementation of public sector human resource development policy:

(a) Macro-human resource development policy linkages in the broad socio-economic, environmental and political context of each country;

(b) The national agency and organizational structure and process in which country policies and strategies are formulated;

(c) The subnational and local structures and mechanisms by which strategies are actually implemented in, for example, schools, universities, training institutions, health care centres, hospitals and workplaces across the country.

The following examples, from different regions, of national efforts to operationalize integrated human resource development programmes provide evidence both of the success of the approach and the difficulties in establishing it.

59. Escuela Nueva, in Colombia, is an example of a basic skill development programme in rural primary schools that has been successful in raising achievement levels while seeking to integrate the school and its environment. This innovative programme has attracted wide and continuing international interest. Communities, parents, teachers and students are collectively engaged in a lively and participatory set of educational experiences that focus not only on the basics of education, but also on building self-esteem, motivation and social and collaborative skills relevant to life outside the school. Many of the school activities (sports, social events, cultivation of the school garden, interacting with outsiders) are overseen by committees made up of the children and supervised by the teachers.

60. A major contribution of the Escuela Nueva programme has been the design of a new type of modular self-training text. Students are required interactively to select a local reality or community situation particularly relevant to their lives, and to analyse it through a variety of processes that involve not only the teachers and other students, but also parents and community members. Comparisons of findings with written texts and subsequent modifications to the texts based on the students' individual and collective experiences with the

actual situations not only encourage reality-based interaction with those outside the school environment, but also encourage students to treat texts as modifiable entities instead of final authorities.

61. The Development Programme for Displaced Persons, Refugees and Returnees in Central America (PRODERE) came about through the 1988 Special Plan of Economic Cooperation for Central America adopted by the General Assembly supporting the agreements concluded in the 1987 Esquipulas II peace plan (A/42/521-S/19085, annex). Esquipulas II was signed by the Presidents of Central America as an effort to deal with internal strife and violence. PRODERE's main goals are to move forward with the peace process in Central America and to address lack of security, food, safe drinking-water, housing, jobs, sanitation, health facilities and schools in war-torn countries. Often the shortage of employment opportunities and lack of skills of returning combatants contributes to rootlessness and slows down reintegration. In Guatemala, access to credit and improved infrastructure encouraged over 2,000 people to join a community coffee growers' association. In Nicaragua, the army donated a military base to the United Nations to be converted into an agricultural training/demonstration centre. El Salvador has established a building materials bank to enable people to rebuild their homes.

62. A variety of state institutions and non-governmental organizations are involved in implementation and planning. A cornerstone of PRODERE projects are the local planning units. These technical teams operate within the framework of local authority institutions, such as municipal councils, and provide those institutions with guidance and support for decision-making. Decisions are then reviewed by the local planning unit to ensure that the local human development master plan is being adhered to. They participate in negotiations and consultations between the various social actors and aim to promote commonality in purpose and project target. Main local planning unit objectives include the planning, management and development of national implementation capacities at the local level to support the sustainability of policies, programmes and projects.

63. Since 1990, in six programme countries, PRODERE has had an impact on the lives of approximately 1 million people. Twelve hundred kilometres of rural roads have been built, 278 schools have been erected or rebuilt, 240,000 people more receive potable drinking-water, 80 health units have been built and 32,000 agricultural producers have benefited from over $9 million in agricultural credits. In addition, 30,000 people have received the benefits of a programme of personal documentation and legalization of land, and 1,000 social organizations now have legal recognition. All of these benefits are estimated to have cost only $20 per beneficiary per year. 23/

64. Thailand's Seventh Development Plan fosters a multi-sectoral approach to human resource development, building on the Sixth Development Plan which included a sectoral approach to human resource development, social and cultural development, science and technology development, manpower development, as well as an integrated rural development strategy incorporating village production plans. In addition to the above-mentioned categories, the Seventh Plan aims to cover the high-priority issues of solving environmental problems as well as increasing cooperation between the public, private, and the non-profit sectors

(e.g. non-governmental organizations and religious institutions). The quality of life aspects of human resource development have long been the focus of development plans in Thailand and are currently under review in the Seventh Plan. With this multi-sectoral approach to human resource development, Thailand anticipates a decrease in population growth rate, infant and adult mortality rates, and increased access to basic education especially for those living below poverty levels in rural areas.

65. In its commitment to an integrated approach to human resource development, the National Economic and Social Development Board under the Office of the Prime Minister has been designated as the specific focal point agency for human resource development. The Board analyses issues, sets targets and creates guidelines for human resource development. It also disseminates related publications and organizes technical workshops and seminars. This creates a formulation and implementation centre for national policies with an intersectoral approach towards coordination through subcommittees.

66. To foster an intersectoral approach, the Board has created and chairs an inter-agency subcommittee on human resources and social development comprised of senior government officials, private officials from a variety of ministries and experts from various organizations, government agencies, and local universities. This subcommittee formulates human resource and human development plans and policies, and collaborates with the subcommittees on science and technology and rural development planning, also created by the Board. The Ministries of Education, Public Health, Interior, University Affairs, Science, and Technology and Energy are also actively included in the human resource development process. The main monitoring and evaluation mechanism is a mid-plan review executed through the Board. The responsibility for monitoring falls to the Human Resources Planning Division, which serves as the secretariat (together with the Social Project Division) to the subcommittee mentioned above.

67. The National Economic and Social Development Board, the National Education Commission and the Department of Labour Protection and Welfare serve as the national human resource development information base. Research is provided by various institutions and universities through financial assistance from the Government and from external sources. The Government supports the National Research Council of Thailand and the Thailand Institute of Scientific and Technological Research. Outside support is received by the Thailand Development Research Institute, Thammasat University and Chulalongkorn University. Human resource development research also takes place at the Human Resources Institute, the National Institute of Development Administration and the Gender and Development Research Institute.

68. One of the primary goals in Thailand in terms of human resource development is increased public participation through the inclusion of non-governmental organizations and the private sector, disadvantaged groups, communities and individuals. Thus, grass-roots-level participation in support of human resource development emerged in 1983 when village committees were organized under the guidance of the Ministry of the Interior.

69. Additionally, Thailand has also targeted specific ethnic groups, low-income earners, children and the elderly because of the higher return to human resource

investment and because of the greater need within disadvantaged groups. Further, Thailand has also targeted special population groups such as scientific and technological workers, farm workers, extension workers and managers. Although most countries have targeted basic education for all members of society, Thailand (along with Viet Nam) has a special plan for expanding basic education for children in remote rural and mountainous areas. These children have not reaped the benefits of past programmes at the same rate as more socially integrated groups, but the rewards of those efforts are expected to be reflected in future indicators.

70. Available evidence points to a high success rate for social development. Ninety-eight percent of Thai children of both sexes are in school by 7 years of age, primary health care extends to 90 per cent of Thai villages and two thirds of rural villages have access to safe drinking-water. Literacy rates have increased to 93.6 per cent from about 31 per cent in 1938. Infant mortality is now at the low level of 40 per 1000 live births, a reduction of one half in the two decades prior to 1980. Childhood third-degree malnutrition is rarely seen.

71. In the Philippines, human resource development policy-making and coordination, as in Thailand, have taken an integrated approach through the Successor Development Plan (1993-1994), focusing efforts especially on the issue of empowerment. The previous human resource development components were put forward in the Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan (1987-1992) and the updated Philippine Development Plan (1984-1987). The Medium-Term Plan concentrated on the alleviation of poverty, generation of more productive employment, promotion of equity and social justice, and the attainment of sustainable economic growth. The updated plan emphasized human development as an end and a means towards economic progress.

72. The focal point of human resource development policy is the Social Development Committee of the National Economic and Development Agency. An integrated approach to human resource development is found through the inclusion of the Nutrition Council Board, Children's Welfare Council and related agencies. human resource development plans, policies and programmes are created through the Committee, which is active in monitoring and coordinating human resource development programmes. In addition, the Committee acts as a consultant to the President and the Board of the Agency on various human resource development-related topics, such as health, manpower, family planning and housing, and makes recommendations based on national development objectives and priorities.

73. The various agencies are responsible individually for creating information systems for coordination, planning, evaluation and monitoring of human resource development programmes. Information materials on those programmes are disseminated through print, radio and television with the involvement of the Philippine Information Agency, together with the appropriate agencies.

74. Non-governmental organization participation in human resource development policy, planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation is achieved through public hearings and private sector consultations and by inclusion as members of various levels of councils and committees, for example, intersectoral/sectoral/agency and regional/subregional. The Medium-Term Philippine Development Plan

evolved through this route with public hearings and private consultations being a key component of plan formulation.

75. Similar to Thailand's targeting of specified needy groups, the Philippines has specified the need to target women, children, the disabled and youth. In terms of the labour force, the Philippines has focused efforts on the unemployed as opposed to potential sources of labour as in other countries. Technological workers, farm workers, extension workers and managers are also receiving special attention as in Thailand.

76. The Government of Ethiopia is implementing a national programme on Capacity Building for Sustained Human Resources Development and Utilisation. This programme has explicitly recognized the interdependence between the sectors of health and basic needs, education and training, employment and livelihood, science and technology, policy formulation and planning and human freedoms and opportunities. This comprehensive approach to the provision of these services is considered by the Government to be a prerequisite for economic growth and social development. The Programme looks at ways in which Government in partnership with other important constituencies (non-governmental organizations, the private sector, local communities) can facilitate the process by which individuals can develop and refine their knowledge/skills base throughout their lives, as well as use such skills and knowledge for contributions to themselves and others.

77. The programme has set a number of objectives over the coming five years, which include decentralization of services; ensuring active participation of people and their local organizations in the development process, as well as the promotion of good governance and sustainability of interventions; strengthening of capacities for education and training in skills consistent with national development needs and aspirations; and the creation of productive self-employment opportunities in the formal and informal sectors, diversifying where feasible from on-farm to off-farm employment to reduce pressure on fragile lands.

78. The management structure for the programme is decentralized to the implementing regional, zonal and <u>woredas</u> authorities and communities who are the direct beneficiaries and partners in the programme. The general approach has been to form management teams in the localities where implementation has commenced. Concerned sector bureaux (e.g., health, education and labour) have taken responsibility for the local management of the activities in each of the appropriate subprogrammes. A series of consultations have been held in the regions to present the National Programme to regional authorities and deliberate in greater detail the implementation strategies. Attention was given at those meetings to the preparations of area-specific action plans, building capacity and strengthening existing capacities at subnational levels and the direct involvement of communities, local development associations and indigenous non-governmental organizations. At the central level the Ministry of Planning and Economic Development is the national executing agency for the programme. A Programme Management Secretariat has been established in the Ministry, and staffed with full-time government and programme officers. The Secretariat is responsible for the management and follow-up, on a day-to-day basis, of the implementation of the overall programme.

79. In the Seychelles, the Human Resources Development Programme addresses issues such as localization, productivity enhancement, job creation, gender mainstreaming, and employment market information systems. The Programme has been conceived as an essential part of the ongoing and dynamic process of economic and social change in the country and focuses explicitly on the human resource dimension. The central objective of the programme is to focus on increasing labour productivity through the provision of an enabling environment and incentives to the private sector and through capacity-building and efficiency reforms in the public sector. The Programme is guided by five major interlinked parameters: (a) reduction of dependence on expatriate personnel; (b) productivity enhancement; (c) capacity-building; (d) gender mainstreaming; and (e) support to private initiatives.

80. In the transition economies, policies are shifting towards more labour-intensive industries where comparative economic advantage can be maintained. Retraining has accompanied privatization and gradual strategies for the restructuring of enterprises and the reabsorption of the unemployed have been adopted in several of the European transition economies such as the Czech Republic, Romania and Ukraine. Kazakstan has recently completed a broad cross-sectoral review of priority needs in the education, labour, health and social protection sectors. Parallel to that effort was an examination of highest-priority financial aspects of fundamental social services in relation to budget preparation. Specifically, the Government of Kazakstan has identified major initiatives for addressing both short- and medium-term problems that require more integrated strategies for solution, with explicit acknowledgement of interdependencies, for example, between health, educational achievement and productive work.

IV. OPERATIONAL ACTIVITIES OF THE UNITED NATIONS SYSTEM IN HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT*

81. The United Nations system continues to undertake a broad range of activities that contribute in some measure to national strategies for human resource development. Apart from human resource development sectoral projects and programmes in health, education and training, and employment, virtually all programmes and projects in the economic and social domain being implemented by the agencies have an human resource development component.

82. It is clear that with the shifting emphasis towards people-centred development, the agencies have made efforts to reorient both their financial allocations and the focus of their programmes to be able to contribute more meaningfully to human resources development at the national level. Much effort has been made by the regional commissions to foster interest and commitment at the national level and particular success can be recorded for the Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP), the Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean (ECLAC) and the Economic Commission for Africa

---

* Documentation for the information referenced in this chapter was provided by agencies and organizations of the United Nations system specifically for the present report.

(ECA). However, as noted earlier, genuine intersectoral policies and strategies for integrated human resource development at the national level are still emerging. In cases where strategies have been put in place at the national level, United Nations agencies, either singly or combined, have sought to assist Governments in the formulation and implementation phases of national programmes and interventions. Where strategies have not yet been fully defined, agencies have sought to make their contribution by targeting specific sectors in accordance with their mandate and focusing on the "development" of human resources explicitly through training. This, for example, would be the case for the interventions being made by agencies such as the United Nations Commission for Trade and Development (UNCTAD), the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), the United Nations Commission for Human Settlements, the United Nations University (UNU) and the World Intellectual Property Organization (WIPO). UNU is formulating specific postgraduate training programmes in the areas of environmentally sustainable development and peace and security and global governance.

83. Through 1994, UNCTAD continued to train human resources/manpower for trade and related services through programmes such as TRAINMAR and TRAINFORTRADE. From mid-1992 to 1994, 39 workshops were held, targeting more than 750 officials from recipient countries. The thrust of UNCTAD efforts is to identify sectoral human resource development needs, develop and adapt high quality training programmes, train trainers and promote cooperation between developing country training institutions. The International Trade Centre UNCTAD/GATT carries out a wide range of training-related activities in export development and trade promotion. These include training of trainers, skills enhancement of exporters, trade officials or representatives of trade support services and the development of training materials. To meet the evolving training needs of recipient countries, priority will be given to building sustainable, national training capacities concerned with practical in-career training. ITU activities for human resource development fall into two main categories. The agency designs and implements national and regional projects in human resource development for telecommunications organizations; and manages a programme that it implements in cooperation with other partners. In 1993 and 1994, a number of interregional, regional and national training activities were organized in Brazil, Mozambique, Peru, Ecuador, Saudi Arabia, Yemen, Ghana, Nigeria, Thailand and Viet Nam.

84. For UNCHS, human resource development in combination with organizational strengthening has been the central focus of the organization. The agency concentrates its activities in four main areas, namely, settlement management and local leadership training; sustainable cities; women in human settlements development and housing in development. In 1993 and 1994 alone, 26 training workshops, courses and seminars were implemented for some 650 participants from 65 countries. UNCHS has also initiated capacity-building projects in Ecuador, Costa Rica, Ghana and Uganda, integrating issues of decentralized planning with community empowerment through training and self-help in construction of services and facilities, housing improvements and income-generation. The UNDP/UNCHS/ World Bank Urban Management Programme has human resource development as one of its key areas of focus. This is articulated primarily through development of professional capacity of its regional panels of experts in the five team areas of the programme: municipal finance and administration, urban infrastructure management, urban land management and urban poverty alleviation.

85. WIPO confines its interventions in human resource development to training public and private sector officials in basic or specialized knowledge of the law, administration, enforcement and use of industrial property as well as in the field of patent and documentation and information. Developing human resources for development is also a central component of UNCHS technical cooperation projects currently implemented in about 100 countries in all major regions.

86. UNIDO has recast its approach to the development of human resources and entrepreneurship for industry to reflect the fact that productivity depends not only on key actors like entrepreneurs and managers but on the enterprise as a whole and on its environment. To promote meritorious industrial outputs, UNIDO's human resource development support interventions stress the systematic stimulation of entrepreneurial and behaviour throughout an industrial enterprise. UNIDO offers a demand-oriented, integrated human resource development programme in three primary areas interlocking at three levels of support intervention: (a) policy advice based on analysis and assessment of requirements; (b) institutional capacity-building and catalytic learning systems, including training, at subsector levels and in specialized fields; and (c) communication networks to facilitate coordination and synergy of efforts.

87. In seeking to ensure the adoption of intersectoral approaches to human resource development, the International Research and Training Institute for the Advancement of Women (INSTRAW) has developed training packages and in 1994 conducted training activities for women on water supply and sanitation, new and renewable sources of energy, environmental management and sustainable development. INSTRAW's goal is to integrate the contribution of women in the development process and to improve their skills and potentials as equal partners in the human resource development process.

88. Human resource development has continued to be a key dimension in ILO multisectoral activities at the national level and features prominently in the country objectives' reviews being undertaken by ILO with its member States. Inter-agency cooperation has increased, in particular through UNDP-funded technical support services multidisciplinary missions. ILO participated in 18 such activities directly related to employment, training and human resource development during 1992-1993 and will have completed its participation in another 16 during 1994-1995.

89. The efforts of the regional commissions are exemplary in terms of providing the conceptual framework for the national efforts in human resource development and an entry point for agencies such as the World Bank, UNDP, the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO), the United Nations Capital Development Fund and the Department for Development Support and Management Services (DDSMS) to assist national authorities to focus their attention on formulating and implementing integrated human resource development programmes. Some examples of the contribution of these commissions to national integrated human resource development follow.

90. For the 1990s, faced with the need for countries in the region to redirect social policies more towards improved productivity with social equity, ECLAC

put forward a comprehensive conceptual framework relating investment in human resources to the twin goals of technical progress and productive employment. 24/ While acknowledging the considerable intraregional diversity among its member States, ECLAC noted that, in general, despite rich natural resources, broad expansion in educational opportunity and rapid industrialization in many areas, development remains uneven both across and within countries. Rates of productivity growth slowed during the 1980s, many urban and industrial infrastructures are deteriorating and technological progress has been sluggish. Furthermore, jobs have not been created at a rate commensurate with expansion in the economically active population, resulting in structural changes in employment patterns disproportionately affecting the most vulnerable (and especially women) in the form of less opportunities for secure work as well as depressed wages.

91. Perhaps most disturbing is the finding that "education seems to have lost its effectiveness as a determining factor in relative income and [as a] potential source of occupational mobility". 25/ ECLAC has documented what is perceived as the "deep gulf between the traditional education system, whose bases were designed in the nineteenth century, and the demands of the society which is taking shape for the twenty-first century, with a paradigm of production which is changing at a dizzy rate and whose development is increasingly based on knowledge, technical progress, innovation and creativity". 26/

92. ECLAC has proposed a multifaceted, multisectoral set of strategies that links the systematic harnessing of technology to enhance international competitiveness and increasing productive employment to human resource investments. The three central elements in this approach to changing production patterns with social equity can be mutually reinforcing. Technological progress is seen as leading to higher and sustainable levels of productivity, with correspondingly increased capacity for an economy to create a larger number of productive jobs. Such changes, however, are also seen as contingent only on equitable human resource investments, which lead to higher levels of entrepreneurial capability and better health, education and training of those in the workforce.

93. The nutrition of children and mothers, access to clean water and adequate sanitation, and equity of opportunity for education and training of appropriate quality (supported by minimal transfer programmes for the most needy) are at the foundation of the human resource aspects of this approach. In particular, education, training and the ability on the part of participants to learn how to "access knowledge" effectively in fast-changing and interactive cultural and commercial scenarios have been proposed not just as basic social services, but as keystones in technological progress. One example of this is UNU's ongoing work in formulating guidelines and providing training in rapid assessment procedures, particularly related to nutrition and health related intervention programmes.

94. Furthermore, such social investment is proposed as a key factor in poverty eradication, by: 27/

"Halting the transmission of poverty from one generation to another. The highest fertility rates are found precisely in the poorest families; likewise mothers of poor families run the biggest risk of having difficult pregnancies; their children suffer from the worst nutritional deficiencies, and they have the biggest problems of learning in school, and register the highest rates of repeating school years and dropping out of school altogether. Later they have the greatest likelihood of ending up in dead-end low productivity jobs in the informal sector, thus completing the vicious circle of poverty".

95. To be effective, intervention in this cycle must be multisectoral and comprehensive, and where possible focused on and supportive of the family/household as the critical socio-economic and cultural unit for sustainable human development. Decentralization of more decision-making to subnational, institutional and community levels, greater local autonomy, strong consensus-building and popular participation are essential components of the strategy. At the centre is the relationship of educational systems to the effective functioning of both the society and the economy.

96. ECLAC and the UNESCO Regional Office for Latin America and the Caribbean are collaborating to bring the best from both intraregional and extraregional experience to bear on the educational, training and associated research issues of the region. 28/ The central role of the human resource supply-side institutions and processes in transmission of knowledge, skills and productive competencies as well as cultural and ethical values is explicitly recognized. The shortcomings of many of these institutions also are identified, however, primarily in terms of bureaucratic rigidity and weak connections with the changing technological, commercial and trade environment in the region.

97. A strategy for transformation of education and training institutions is proposed, which reduces their isolation from the cutting edges of scientific and technological change, improves articulation between the supply of and demand for human resources through better understanding of systems of production, and acknowledges the crucial intersectoral links between the economy and society at both individual and collective levels. While detailed policy formulation remains the role of individual nations in the light of their own special circumstances, regional and international cooperation can be a strong facilitating force for these principles. The Quito Declaration of April 1991 is one index of statutory commitment of educational authorities in the region to the need for much broader mechanisms and strategies for consultation among the various government sectors, and between the latter and non-governmental organizations, private companies, the media, church bodies, trade union and community organizations and the families themselves.

98. The Jakarta Plan of Action, adopted by ESCAP in April 1988 at its forty-fourth session, reaffirmed commitments by signatories to human resource development as a key strategy for combating poverty in the region and has provided a robust conceptual framework for country efforts in this regard. The Plan acknowledges that past development programmes have often targeted only economic growth at the expense of deeper social fabrics, have often bypassed the majority of people and have failed to deal with rising redundancy of the potentially economically active, especially women of the region. Its focus is

threefold: predominantly people-centred approaches rather than centred on physical or financial capital or on technology; integrated treatment of human resource development supply and demand factors; and emphasis on participation in economic activity, and in particular employment. Additional characteristics of the Plan's unique structure are its focus on the household and on better understanding of inhibiting and facilitating factors surrounding household decisions on human resource development. In particular, the high degree of overlap is recognized between sectoral service modalities affecting improvements in quality of life, such as nutrition, health and education.

99. The pursuit of interministerial, intersectoral mechanisms for implementation of the Jakarta Plan has been matched by regional support of several United Nations system agencies (e.g. UNICEF, UNDP, ILO, UNESCO and WHO). Revision of the Plan resulted in 1994, following ESCAP resolution 48/6 of April 1992 to ensure adaptation to the fast-changing regional context for human resource development. Major changes have included strengthening the overarching theoretical framework to identify and refine its major human resource development components more clearly, a narrowing of focus to key practical and high-priority activities, and updating implementing arrangements to reflect changing regional circumstances.

100. The issue of sustainability of human resource development efforts is central to the revised Plan. Human resource development is seen as an iterative process by which each country addresses strategically its own issues of investment in and utilization of human resources so as to increase productive capabilities of people as well as increase productivity itself. Critical also is the effective participation of all human beings - who embody the country's human resources - in the resulting enhanced quality of life arising as a direct benefit from increased output. To be sustainable, human resource development strategies must ensure contribution to completion of this cycle of investment in capacity, productive enterprise from those in whom these investments are being made and subsequent equity of access to the benefits that result.

101. The analytical framework for the new Jakarta Plan also introduces some of the psychological dimensions of human resource development. In assessing costs for example of human resource development investments, the family decision-making structure will take into account inhibiting as well as motivating factors affecting their decisions to invest time in the schooling of girls, the opportunity costs of lost household or other (e.g. agricultural, smallholding or commercial) labour, or cultural/psychological stress on individuals as a consequence of non-traditional occupational or "career" choices. These factors are crucial in determining the sustainability of human resource development policies and programmes on the part of social actors, both governmental and non-governmental.

102. With new technologies sweeping the Asia and Pacific region, human resource development strategies of necessity must complement the nutritional, health and educational aspects of human resource development with recognition of the ways in which technologies can be harnessed as productive resources in themselves, but also for example in education and health technology, as resources for human resource development applications. Communications advances, educational technologies and improved diagnostic and curative health procedures can be

especially useful in addressing the needs of those living in poverty, especially in the remotest areas. In particular, collaborative approaches of enabling groups, both governmental and non-governmental, are becoming most important in face of decentralization of authority for national human resource development programming in many countries, as well as increasing diversification and informalization of economies in the region.

103. While it is too early in the refinement of the Jakarta Plan of Action to assess results of the revision, during the first half of the 1990s, countries have moved forward considerably in their application of the Plan's general principles of priority for human resource development, and its integrated approaches.

104. One important area the implementation of the Jakarta Plan of Action has highlighted is the need for non-governmental organization involvement in the human resource development dialogue and process. ESCAP and UNDP have completed a joint assessment (1991) of their contribution to human resource development in the region. The Jakarta Plan of Action was not explicit in its delineation of the role of non-governmental actors and some Governments may still be reluctant to involve non-governmental organizations actively in human resource development policy. Direct participation of non-governmental organizations in the complex process of implementation of the Plan's recommendations thus remains uneven across countries in the ESCAP region and there is considerable possibility for further pragmatic cooperation, especially at subnational levels.

105. Non-governmental organizations can serve as "enablers" in human resource development activities, particularly in the local districts where those organizations flourish and are credible, and particularly with the most disadvantaged, such as marginalized workers, unemployed females and the rural jobless. They can ease the successful transition in communities towards reducing cultural and social barriers to emerging technologies, encourage parents and families to foster the initiative to become better educated among their children and build support for outreach and extended services in primary health care, especially reproductive health.

106. Examples are provided of community development initiatives among disadvantaged youth in Papua New Guinea, addressing problems of internal migration in Thailand, and assisting deprived and marginalized social groups in Sri Lanka. 29/ Progress is slow in some cases, however, towards the new models of empowerment and more broadly participative social decision-making implied in governmental-non-governmental organization joint action. There remains widespread and pervasive distrust by Governments of non-governmental organization involvement in community development in the region. 30/ Exclusion of large sections of the population, notably women and the rural poor, from effective participation in development is documented in recent surveys. 31/ ESCAP and UNDP however have collaborated in the development of guidelines for increased non-governmental organization participation in this area. 32/

107. In 1990, a United Nations Inter-agency Task Force on Human Resources Development and Utilization in Africa was instrumental with ECA in developing a human resource development framework for the region. This effort started from the major premise of the Khartoum Declaration that:

"Since the human being is the centre of all development, the human condition is the only final measure of development. Improving that condition is essential for the poor and vulnerable human beings who comprise the majority of our people in Africa."

108. The increasing neglect of these dimensions of development during the decade of the eighties and a rapidly worsening human resource situation in most parts of the region prompted a coalition of African Governments, non-governmental organizations and the international community to call for decisive action to promote human resource development strategies within the continent.

109. The resulting framework articulates a rational argument for more comprehensive approaches to human resource development within the particular socio-economic context of each country and, consistent with economic and social aspirations, as expressed by Africans, for the region as a whole. It identifies broad goals and objectives, focusing on areas of particular priority where Governments, non-governmental organizations, regional and subregional development agencies and the international donors might wish to target technical assistance and support.

110. Human resource "planning", "development" and "utilization" are distinguished for policy and programmatic purposes in this framework. Human resource "planning" entails anticipating, at any level of the system (regional to local), the needs for acquisition/application of skills and knowledge and the process of charting out interventions to meet those needs. Human resource "development" provides opportunities to acquire knowledge and skills and nurture attitudes in a society's members so that they are better placed to contribute to the betterment of standards of living. Finally, human resource "utilization" ensures chances for application of skills and knowledge to the production of socially and economically valuable goods and services in a manner that would, in the process, be beneficial to them as individuals.

111. The important functional linkage between social and economic utility is addressed in the African definition, as is the focus on individual and community. There is also an element explicitly of conservation of human resources, as the provision of sustenance by making available to all the necessary access to health/nutrition services, and a physically and socially enabling environment within which effective participation and functionality as members of society are facilitated. Key sectors/subsectors are thus identified as education, training, employment and health and nutrition.

112. ECA is assisting member States in planning, designing, managing, monitoring and evaluating human resource development and utilization by conducting and organizing training workshops, seminars and conferences at the national, subregional and regional levels for senior government officials and personnel from both the private and parastatal sectors, providing advisory services to member States on manpower and employment planning, assisting them in strengthening the institutional machinery for human resource development and utilizations.

113. These efforts of the regional commissions have provided an entry point for some of the United Nations agencies and Bretton Woods institutions to support

country initiatives in implementing integrated human resource development programmes and strategies. The World Bank, for example, has increased its lending for human resource development (health, education, population and nutrition) almost five-fold since the early 1980s, reinforcing its view that investing in people is crucial for reducing poverty and for promoting economic growth. In the fiscal year 1994, human resource development attracted $3,104 million in commitments (15 per cent of its total commitments). Additionally, 18 per cent of all new international development aid commitments - some $1,198 million - were directed towards human resource development. Human resource development features prominently in the Bank's operations and sector work. Strategies are being moulded to the specific needs of individual countries. For example, basic education services are being supported in Yemen; in Morocco, surveys of health and education indicators and facilities are providing the basis for analysing a crucial set of issues in the area of government expenditure in the social services. 33/

114. Since 1990, UNDP has facilitated a development approach that has focused on investing in people and on the issue of sustainability. One of the main components of this approach is human resource development. While encouraging and assisting Governments to develop integrated national human resource development programmes (these include Bangladesh, Botswana, Indonesia, Kazakstan, Lesotho, Nepal and Seychelles), the agency has continued to support sectoral interventions in health, education and employment, as well as in training human resources in virtually all sectors of the economy. In pursuing an integrated approach to human resource development, UNDP has, as noted above, assisted the Government of Ethiopia in coordination with UNESCO, ILO, FAO, WHO, UNIDO, the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), UNICEF and UNCHS in the formulation of the national programme on capacity-building for sustained human resource development and utilization.

115. FAO has continued to apply development communication methods and media to share knowledge and skills and to improve the quality and outreach of training activities for human resource development. For example, a large regional project in Latin America is developing national capacity in the use of video for small farmer training. A regional project in southern Africa is providing training to managers and field workers in interpersonal communication skills and the use of low-cost audiovisual materials. Rural radio remains the most effective mass medium to reach large numbers of rural audiences and FAO is continuing its efforts to strengthen rural radio services, especially in Africa.

116. In Colombia, FAO has implemented a pilot project in participatory education and training required for rural production in Zaragoza, Cartago Valle. The project aims at developing a new curriculum at the secondary level which relates the demand and supply of human resource development to meet local and regional needs. It has actively involved local, regional and national education authorities, teachers, parents, students, potential employers, non-governmental organizations and regional public and private institutions/organizations that can assist in the designing and testing of the new curriculum. This curriculum would initiate students in the basic humanistic knowledge and technical skills to allow graduated students to pursue higher studies or to find productive work either with local employers or self-employed in their families' enterprises. A cooperative established by the participants serves as a permanent mechanism to

mobilize local interest, technical and financial resources to support training of the manpower that local development requires.

117. While focusing on human resource development training activities, FAO has managed to promote in developing countries, an increased integration into agricultural extension and education programmes of population and nutrition education. Within the framework of FAO technical support programmes and activities on agricultural and rural development, technical advice and assistance is provided to member countries in carrying out studies and surveys on technical and professional manpower resources in the agricultural sector. Methodological work on manpower planning for rural development is also carried out in order to respond to requests from member Governments and national institutions for information on manpower planning strategies, approaches and techniques. The programmes of the United Nations Capital Development Fund facilitate human resource development through the integrated provision of infrastructure and small-scale credit and guarantee schemes. Focusing on the basic needs of those living in poverty in rural areas, the assistance of the Fund enables this target group to attain access to health centres, schools, clean water supply and social housing. Currently the agency dedicates on average 21.3 per cent of its annual project approvals to the provision of basic services.

118. UNESCO has for several years emphasized the concept of human resource development and in outlining its position for the Summit on Social Development, 34/ the Organization has noted that sustainable social development requires a radically reoriented programme of human resource development, not in the narrow managerial sense, but in a broader sense of improvement of the quality of life: better education, better health, respect for human rights, democracy, rational use of resources through the application of recent advances in science and technology, as well as a commitment to the culture of peace and international solidarity.

119. UNESCO has reinforced its presence at the upstream stage of international cooperation by providing advisory services to least developed countries for the formulation of human resource development policies and strategies. Its current upstream activities tend to focus understandably on the education and training component of human resource development but are gradually being extended to integrate and include other areas within its sphere of competence, such as culture, science and technology. To support the shift towards multisectoral programming UNESCO has endeavoured to work closely with other United Nations agencies in the formulation and implementation process. Thus in Chad, UNESCO and ILO assisted the Government in developing a comprehensive multisectoral programme integrating education, training and employment. In Guinea, UNESCO participated along with UNDP, UNICEF, FAO, the World Bank, IMF, UNFPA, WHO, WFP, UNHCR and UNIDO in the formulation of two multisectoral programmes whose objectives are to reduce poverty and to increase popular participation in the national development process.

120. Two projects executed by the Department for Development Support and Management Services in cooperation with UNDP, UNICEF, the United Nations Capital Development Fund, the United Nations Development Fund for Women (UNIFEM), the United Nations Volunteers, the African Development Bank and the Government of

the Netherlands can serve as a noteworthy example of the Department's efforts to promote an integrated approach to human resource development. In Swaziland, the intervention focuses on integrating the training of rural women in business and technical income-generating skills with access to credit and post-training advisory and referral services. To date some 3,000 women have benefited from this training and have had the opportunity to establish viable businesses either individually or in groups. This project clearly demonstrates the important interrelationship in human resource development between access to education and training and improvement and sustaining of livelihoods. The second project, in the Central African Republic, enhances the earning capacity of individuals and groups through support to small-scale community-based economic development and income-generating activities. Focusing on rural communities, the project offers integrated training in literacy, project management and administration, business and technical skills in order to implement activities selected by villagers themselves and aimed at meeting their primary needs. In addition to these projects, the Department for Development Support and Management Services has also undertaken a number of innovative activities in integrated human resource development within the framework of the programme approach in a number of countries such as Burkina Faso (systemic approach to civil service reform), Malawi (survey on training needs and resource assessment regarding human resource development and institutional capacity at the district level), Thailand (gender analysis of positions in the civil service system) and Viet Nam (assisting in redesigning human resource development).

121. Further, through a series of meetings and seminars, the Department has sought to encourage debate on human resource development. These include the Pan-African Conference of Ministers of the Civil Service, arranged in cooperation with the African Training and Research Centre in Administration for Development, in June 1994 in Morocco; and an expert group meeting on human resource development in the public service held in New York in June 1994. One of the objectives of the conference in Morocco was to review the most recent experience in human resource development and to highlight the factors of success and failure. The expert group meeting brought together experts in the field from the World Bank, UNDP, ILO, Ghana and Malaysia as well as academics to develop guidelines, methodologies and techniques for use in planning and organizing human resource development.

122. Inter-agency efforts in cross-sectoral human resource development applications have included the PRODERE example already described in paragraphs 61 to 63. Specifically, United Nations agencies such as UNDP, WHO, the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO), ILO, UNHCR, the World Food Programme (WFP) and UNICEF have played an active part in coordinating PRODERE projects. UNHCR and PRODERE have concentrated on refugee care, obtaining a wider range of legal and social guarantees from countries of asylum and repatriation efforts. WHO and PAHO have promoted local health systems to decentralize health services and provide primary health care. ILO has fostered an organizational initiative called agencies for local economic development to provide access to channels of production through credit, technical assistance and training to those groups facing exclusion from economic development.

123. It is clear from the above that the United Nations system has made substantial efforts to support regionally sensitive conceptual frameworks for

human resource development. Where Governments have perceived the validity of those frameworks and their utility for the national development process, the United Nations agencies have been able to make substantial contributions to shaping country efforts at integrated human resource development programming. However, where such commitment has been lacking at the national level, United Nations agencies have tended for the most part to structure their interventions in a sectoral manner and to focus on training at different levels. And, while such interventions can be considered as contributing to the national investment in human resources, their value remains limited at best without an overall human resource development policy framework being in place.

Financial support

124. The availability of financial support for United Nations system activities in human resource development is an important factor in the corresponding support at the disposal of countries. Although human resource development policies focus on the alleviation and remediation of significant and apparent problems, the allocation of resources has become a serious issue. Figures specific to human resource development are not disaggregated and precise funding levels cannot be determined, but overall development assistance figures describe a worrisome trend.

125. At present the average industrialized nation gives just 0.29 per cent of GNP - down from 0.33 per cent - in aid to the developing world, the lowest figure since 1973. Development assistance to developing countries from countries of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD) fell sharply in 1993, from $60.8 billion in 1992 to $54.8 billion in 1993, a decrease of some 10 per cent. Emergency aid and distress relief rose from 3 per cent of bilateral assistance in 1990 to 6 per cent in 1992. These figures are explained in part by the fact that the cost of peace-keeping operations has risen from $0.3 billion to $3.6 billion over the last five years and the share of United Nations assistance being devoted to relief and emergency work has increased from 25 per cent of the total budget in 1988 to 45 per cent in 1992. Thus while overall development assistance has dropped to pre-1990 levels, the portion going to crises rather than underlying problems has increased sharply. 35/

126. At present government expenditures in the developing world total approximately $440 billion a year, of which only just over 10 per cent, or about $50 billion, is allocated to nutrition, basic health care, primary education, family planning and clean water and safe sanitation for rural and peri-urban areas. 36/

127. Only about 25 per cent of current aid goes to the countries where three quarters of the world's poorest billion people now live. Only 15 per cent goes to the agricultural sector, which provides a livelihood for the majority of people in almost all developing countries. Only about 2 per cent goes to primary education, roughly 4 per cent to primary health care and less than 2 per cent to family planning services. 37/

128. In the absence of available data on human resource development receipts and expenditures, the overall structure of resource availability and disbursement for the system as a whole is provided in the following tables. Table 1 provides data on contributions from Governments and other sources for operational activities of the United Nations system from 1989 to 1993. As the table shows, from 1989 to 1992, absolute amounts increased in total for funds and programmes as well as specialized agencies, as did rate of growth (from 8 to 13 per cent). The year 1993, however, shows a substantial decrease in contributions of just over 10 per cent from the previous year. Table 2 shows expenditures by the system on development grants and loans over the same time period.

Table 1. Contributions from Governments and other sources for operational activities of the United Nations system: overview, 1989-1993

(Millions of current United States dollars)

	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993
Contributions to United Nations funds and programmes					
1. Contributions to UNDP a/	1 075.2	1 192.9	1 242.0	1 481.8	1 318.3
2. Contributions to UNDP-administered funds and trust funds b/	129.9	128.5	103.3	283.8	126.9
Subtotal (1-2)	1 205.1	1 321.4	1 345.3	1 765.6	1 445.2
3. Contributions to UNFPA c/	203.7	227.8	272.6	293.8	265.1
4. Contributions to UNICEF d/	635.8	785.7	781.6	918.5	793.7
5. Contributions to other United Nations funds and programmes e/	35.7	66.8	62.3	73.5	55.0
6. Contributions to WFP f/	1 064.6	1 029.1	1 404.6	1 722.4	1 421.1
Subtotal (1-6)	3 144.9	3 430.8	3 866.4	4 773.8	3 980.0
Contributions for operational activities of specialized agencies					
7. Assessed contributions to regular budgets g/	246.2	216.5	272.1	219.4	345.8
8. Extrabudgetary contributions	537.1	604.9	676.2	649.5	706.5
Subtotal (7-8)	783.3	821.4	948.3	868.9	1 052.3
Total	3 928.2	4 252.2	4 814.7	5 642.7	5 032.3
Contributions to IFAD and the World Bank group					
9. Contributions to IFAD	77.5	129.0	194.6	336.3	32.4
10. Contributions to IDA	3 737.4	3 478.6	4 850.1	4 034.0	3 977.6
11. Capital subscription payments to IBRD	712.0	511.6	118.3	1 085.2	127.1
12. Capital subscription payments to IFC	80.7	167.1	74.2	76.0	253.2

/...

	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993
Memo items					
Supplementary items					
Contributions for refugees, humanitarian, special economic and disaster relief activities h/	814.1	836.4	1 872.2	1 147.4	1 092.0
UNEP Environment Fund	45.2	61.5	60.7	77.0	81.9
Explanatory items					
Cost-sharing and government counterpart contributions to UNDP	128.0	173.5	292.5	293.8	421.6
UNICEF Greeting Cards	49.2	89.7	69.6	95.2	95.1
Government "self-supporting" contributions to organizations and agencies	55.8	69.1	64.5	77.7	72.2
Funds received by United Nations agencies for activities financed under World Bank loans/credits	44.3	40.3	55.7	60.0	48.1

Source: Financial statements of United Nations funds and programmes and of WFP: internal reports of the World Bank and IFAD.

(Footnotes on following page)

(Footnotes to table)

---

a/ Includes cost-sharing and government cash counterpart contributions, and contributions to the Special Measures Fund for Least Developed Countries.

b/ Includes the Capital Development Fund, the Special Fund for Land-locked Developing Countries, the Revolving Fund for Natural Resources Exploration, the Special United Nations Volunteer Fund, the United Nations Fund for Science and Technology for Development, the United Nations Development Fund for Women and the Trust Fund for Sudano-Sahelian Activities; and other funds, accounts and trust funds of UNDP, including trust funds established by the Administrator, and contributions for the Junior Professional Officers programme. Includes cost-sharing contributions to these funds.

c/ Includes contributions to trust funds and "special population programmes" of UNFPA.

d/ Includes net profit from sale of greeting cards, which resources are then used in operational activities.

e/ Constitutes regular budget and extrabudgetary contributions, including government self-supporting contributions, in relation to the United Nations, and its regional commissions, UNCHS, UNCTC, UNCTAD and UNDCP. See also the annual UNDP document on United Nations system regular and extrabudgetary technical cooperation financed from sources other than UNDP.

f/ Includes contributions to the International Emergency Food Reserve and extrabudgetary contributions.

g/ I.e. the imputed share of regular budget financing of technical cooperation expenditures in relation to the distribution of assessments among Member States.

h/ Includes contributions to UNHCR, UNRWA, UNDRO and United Nations trust funds for emergency assistance (including special economic assistance programmes) from sources external to the United Nations system. Regarding contributions for WFP emergency operations, see footnote (f) above.

Table 2. Expenditures on operational activities of the United Nations system: overview, 1989-1993

(Millions of current United States dollars)

	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993
Development grants					
1. Financed by UNDP a/	883.4	1 035.7	1 123.6	1 026.8	1 031.0
2. Financed by UNDP-administered funds	97.6	98.0	114.1	137.6	173.4
3. Financed by UNFPA	157.2	179.5	171.8	128.2	134.3
4. Financed by UNICEF	501.1	584.3	591.1	743.8	803.7
5. Financed by WFP b/	952.6	956.4	1 337.9	1 575.2	1 487.7
6. Financed by regular budgets c/	246.2	233.9	287.5	241.6	345.8
7. Financed by specialized agencies and other organizations from extrabudgetary sources d/	557.7	686.1	663.4	727.2	891.9
Total	3 395.8	3 773.9	4 289.4	4 580.4	4 867.8
Concessional loans					
8. Disbursements by IFAD	158.1	139.3	114.9	130.8	160.8
9. Disbursement by IDA					
(a) Gross disbursement	3 477.0	4 242.0	4 611.0	4 836.0	5 013.0
(b) Net disbursement	3 270.0	3 995.7	4 347.0	4 531.0	4 679.0
(c) Net transfer	3 009.0	3 698.5	4 016.0	4 144.0	4 319.0
Non-concessional loans					
10. Disbursement by IBRD					
(a) Gross disbursement	10 842.0	14 048.5	12 033.0	10 365.0	13 114.0
(b) Net disbursement	2 660.0	5 295.7	3 301.0	572.0	3 096.0
(c) Net transfer	(3 745.0)	(1 947.8)	(4 049.0)	(6 865.0)	(4 317.0)

	1989	1990	1991	1992	1993
11. Disbursement by IFC					
(a) Gross disbursement	990.7	1 878.4	985.0	958.0	1 910.3
(b) Net disbursement	566.3	1 188.9	..	..	..
Memo items					
Supplementary items					
Refugee, humanitarian, special economic and disaster relief grant activities e/	888.3	873.7	946.6	1 240.4	1 347.7
UNDP/OPS management service agreements f/	94.3	108.1	102.0	107.0	121.0
Explanatory items					
World Bank/technical cooperation g/	1 118.8	1 053.5	1 142.8	1 197.0	1 447.4
"Self-supporting" expenditures h/	60.5	80.8	68.7	67.7	73.1

Source: See table 1. For definition of terms, see the note on statistical information.

(Footnotes on following page)

(Footnotes to table)

---

a/ I.e. UNDP central resources, including expenditures financed from government cost-sharing contributions.

b/ Includes extrabudgetary expenditures and WFP project expenditures for development activities and emergency operations. Of the latter, most was financed from the International Emergency Food Reserve and the remainder from WFP general resources.

c/ The major share of such expenditures is financed by WHO.

d/ I.e. from funds not elsewhere specified in the table. Starting in 1993 it includes UNEP extrabudgetary expenditures. Also included are expenditures financed from government "self-supporting" contributions, as noted in memo item.

e/ Includes expenditures by UNHCR, UNRWA and United Nations trust funds for emergency assistance (including special economic assistance programmes). Regarding expenditures for WFP emergency operations, see footnote (b) above.

f/ Represents services engaged by Governments receiving loans and credits from international development banks or resources from bilateral donors.

g/ I.e. gross disbursements on "training" and "consultants" embodied in IBRD loans and IDA credits to borrowers.

h/ The amounts of recipient Governments' own resources spent, which are included above in the figures for line 7 (extrabudgetary) are here separated out for reference.

V. COORDINATION OF UNITED NATIONS SYSTEM ACTIVITIES AND DEVELOPING AN INTEGRATED APPROACH

129. In its resolution 47/199 of 22 December 1992, the General Assembly, stressing that the effectiveness and efficiency of the United Nations system should be streamlined and rationalized, recommended a variety of policy, programme and administrative measures to promote increased integration among United Nations agencies. The ongoing implementation of resolution 47/199 effectively reinforces increased collaboration between and support from those United Nations organizations responsible for human resource development.

130. In resolution 47/199, the General Assembly specifically urged the Joint Consultative Group on Policy to give priority to simplifying, harmonizing and increasing the transparency of programme procedures; expanding field level authority to cancel, modify and add programme activities; ensuring that programme component monitoring and evaluation should take into account interrelated and cross-sectoral linkages between the individual strategies of recipient countries and between the individual components of a strategy; the development by interested recipient countries of a country strategy note to, inter alia, promote greater coordination and cooperation at the field level by outlining the specific activities of each funding agency; the establishment of inter-agency coordination mechanisms; and harmonizing accountability systems at field level, including effective programme monitoring, evaluation and management audit systems.

131. The Joint Consultative Group on Policy, the Consultative Committee on Programme and Operational Questions and the ILO International Training Centre at Turin have worked together to enhance the general implementation of the resolution and to encourage complementarities among programmes while maintaining the identity and comparative advantage of the various agencies.

132. Country strategy notes designed to ensure the effective integration of assistance provided by the United Nations system in the development process of countries (resolution 47/199, para. 9) have been initiated by at least 70 programme countries. Country strategy notes are to demonstrate that the specific activities of each funding organization of the United Nations system outlined in a specific country programme prepared by the recipient Government with the assistance of the funding organizations, who should harmonize their cycles and, where appropriate, adapt them to national budget cycles, plans and strategies in order to integrate their response into the development needs of recipient countries (ibid., paras. 9 (d), 10 and 11). Country strategy notes are helping to integrate the field operations of the various institutions and, as most of these operational activities are involved in national capacity-building, the restructuring process should improve the effectiveness of those institutions' support for national human resource development efforts.

133. The process of harmonizing the programme cycles of United Nations funds and programmes is ongoing, as is a continued emphasis on a programme approach focused beyond the narrower perspective inherent in project design. The programme approach offers an effective means of aid coordination that, especially in the human resource development sectors, supports and encourages intersectoral collaboration and harmonization.

134. Operational authority has been decentralized and resident representatives given greater decision-making authority. Resident coordinators and country coordination teams have been trained and strengthened.

135. Annual reports of United Nations agencies testify to progress in coordination within the United Nations system over the past few years. The three agencies with multi-year programme cycles (UNDP, UNICEF and UNFPA) have already taken significant harmonization steps. While the provisions of resolution 47/199 and their follow-up are not directed specifically at the implementation of human resource development strategies, they do argue for greater integration within the United Nations system and parallel the support being shown for integrated human resource development programmes. As the processes of United Nations agency coordination are refined and expanded those agencies responsible for and countries requesting integrated human resource development will both be beneficiaries.

VI. THE WORLD SUMMIT FOR SOCIAL DEVELOPMENT

136. The World Summit for Social Development, held at Copenhagen from 6 to 12 March 1995, brought together over 118 world leaders who agreed on a Declaration and Programme of Action to alleviate and reduce poverty, expand productive employment and enhance social integration. This is the first time that the international community has expressed a clear commitment to eradicate absolute poverty.

137. The terminology of human resources is repeatedly referred to throughout the Copenhagen Declaration and Programme of Action. It is used in its generic sense, not narrowly in the sense only of training, and echoes the transsectoral nature of General Assembly resolutions. In particular, poverty, lack of employment and social exclusion are seen as negatively reinforcing, and representing a waste of human resources, and human resource development itself is explicitly referenced in 4 out of the 10 Commitments. Special priority is given to human resource development in the African region and to economies in transition.

138. Commitment 3 (b), promoting the goal of full employment, states that Governments will "develop policies to expand work opportunities and productivity in both rural and urban sectors by achieving economic growth, investing in human resource development, promoting technologies that generate productive employment, and encouraging self-employment, entrepreneurship, and small and medium-sized enterprises".

139. In Commitment 6, the chapeau shapes the commitment to education, health and culture, in cross-sectoral fashion, as "contributing to the full development of human resources".

140. In Commitment 7, which focuses on the special needs of the African region, the chapeau and paragraph 7 (b) commit to accelerating and giving priority to human resource development in Africa in the context of structural adjustment policies at the national level. This linkage between structural adjustment and its social impacts is reiterated throughout the document and reflects a general

concern to include specific social development goals in programmes for structural adjustment, as underscored in paragraph 91 of the Programme of Action.

141. In Commitment 8, again at the national level, the commitment is made to "promote, in the countries with economies in transition, an integrated approach to the transformation process, addressing the social consequences of reforms and human resource development needs".

142. It is notable that in the documentation, in particular in references to the process of acquiring and applying skills and knowledge, there are several reminders of the need for better articulation between the education and employment systems. For example, in Commitment 3 (d) towards "policies [that] ensure that workers and employers have the education, information and training needed to adapt to changing economic conditions, technologies and labour markets", and in Commitment 6 (i), to "strengthen the links between labour market and education policies, realizing that education and vocational training are vital elements in job creation and in combating unemployment and social exclusion in our societies, and emphasize the role of higher education and scientific research in all plans of social development".

143. The language of the Programme of Action carries forward into more operational terms the same persuasive arguments for human resource development made in the Declaration. In chapter I, on the enabling environment, in paragraph 11 (a), the need is recognized in Africa for "implementing effective policies and development strategies that establish a more favourable climate for social development, trade and investments, giving priority to human resource development and promoting the further development of democratic institutions". The chapter is explicit in emphasizing the role of civil society in more participatory mechanisms for addressing poverty, not only in Africa, but in all world regions.

144. In paragraph 12 (g), making economic growth and the interaction of market forces more conducive to social development requires "ensuring substantial public and private investment in human resource development and in capacity-building in health and education, as well as in empowerment and participation, especially for people living in poverty or suffering from social exclusion".

145. In chapter II, on the eradication of poverty, the urgent need is noted for "human resource development and improved infrastructural facilities". Paragraph 27 (b) of chapter II, section A, on the formulation of integrated strategies for eradicating absolute poverty, calls for "redesigning public investment policies that relate to infrastructure development, the management of natural resources and human resource development to benefit people living in poverty and their compatibility with the long-term improvement of livelihoods". Paragraph 40 (c) of chapter II, section D, on enhanced social protection, points to the potential resourcefulness of older persons, suggesting that particular efforts should be made towards "ensuring that older persons are able to meet their basic human needs through access to social services and social security, that those in need are assisted, that older persons are protected from abuse and violence and are treated as a resource and not a burden".

146. In chapter III, paragraph 43, the changing work environment is associated with greater need for expanded efforts to enhance human resource development, especially for women and young people, and in chapter V, paragraph 89, the human resource development needs of economies in transition are again emphasized.

147. The importance of the World Summit for Social Development to the current global situation lies not only in the commitments undertaken but perhaps more importantly in the recognition of and stature given to the human component of development. That this is a relatively recent phenomenon was noted by President François Mitterrand of France in his address to the World Summit on 11 March 1995:

> "I have participated in a multitude of summits, where just mentioning social aspects was regarded as bizarre behaviour. ... Social problems did not have a place in the discussions among the leaders of this planet as did peace, disarmament, the economy. It was ... as if the functioning of international society depended only on financial and economic mechanisms."

VII. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

A. Conclusions

148. The present report has presented the status of integrated human resource development issues and activities within the purview of the United Nations system and in the context of previous resolutions and the most recent report of the Secretary-General on human resource development to the General Assembly. Rising concern regarding the complex problems facing traditional human resource development sectors is complemented by increasing recognition of the need for more integrated strategies that build on the mutualities across sectors.

149. Extensive difficulties are facing women, girls and particularly young people in countries where the demographics of population and labour force growth are outpacing the responsive capacity of education and employment systems. In many cases these problems have worsened in the last decade. Comprehensive human resource development approaches are required that are sensitive to these concerns and are effective in addressing the major gaps between supply of and demand for human resources. In particular, the focus of human resource development strategies elucidates more usefully the relationship between demographics/competencies of those seeking work/livelihoods and the capacity of existing socio-economic systems to continue to provide other expectation of full employment.

150. Human resource development is defined as empowering people by fostering the contributory capacities that they can bring to the improvement of their own quality of life and that of others in their families, communities, enterprises and societies. Integrated human resource development strategies are therefore explicitly intersectoral, focus on equity in developing individual resourcefulness in socio-economic contexts and include policies and programmes that promote the acquisition and application of knowledge and skills in ways that are mutually beneficial to individuals and the social groupings of which they are a part.

151. There has been since the most recent human resource development report of the Secretary-General a strong "resonance" to that report from all regions. Successive resolutions, culminating in resolution 48/205, have demonstrated support for the stronger coordination of the continuum of services in the development of human resources.

152. The endorsements at the World Summit for Social Development of the importance of human resource development in social development, in 4 out of the 10 Commitments, and notably in the section on integrated strategies in the chapter on poverty, are further evidence of an expanding support base within the development community. Special priority is emphasized in the Copenhagen documentation for human resource development in Africa and in the economies in transition.

153. Explicit attention is provided in the Copenhagen Programme of Action to the linkages between human resource development and the social consequences of structural adjustment. While this connection is made primarily in the case of the poorest and most needy countries, it must be seen in the context of the general concern to protect basic social programmes evident throughout many sections of the documentation.

154. United Nations regional commissions have carried forward the integrated human resource development concept through a combination of studies and regional support for country programmes. The Jakarta Plan of Action in Asia and the Pacific, the ECLAC support for an integrated approach to social equity and changing production patterns, and the African Regional Human Resource Development Framework are examples of this emphasis.

155. Technological change and the effects of globalization are having a dramatic impact on the way people must prepare for and engage in making a living. These effects are not limited to the industrialized world and are being felt increasingly by developing nations. There is thus a clear need for the continuing reassessment of human resource development policies at all levels in view of shifting and increasingly global forces affecting the constitution of employment and livelihoods.

156. While the integrated human resource development concept has gained credibility and recognition, operational definitions have varied considerably, reducing clarity of underlying principles. Although differences in national or local situations will inevitably (and should) contribute to such variance in definitions and the evolutionary nature of human resource development approaches will further mitigate against standardization, greater clarity in both defining and applying integrated human resource development strategies will be beneficial.

157. Coordination across social sectors is increasingly called for in government statements, but there still is a great fractionation in delivery systems. Many government agencies and organizations are involved in the supply side of human resource development, often with independent implementation and little overall coordination. Training is often conducted with little consideration of placement or longevity in resulting jobs. On the employment generation side, some interventions may deal with credit, others with training, placement or

marketing, but there is, as yet, little synergy within and between involved agencies.

158. United Nations system activities are increasingly reflecting closer inter-agency coordination, multi-agency collaboration and attention to the intersectorality of solutions to country human resource development needs. While this trend is still developing, there is evidence of greater recognition of the importance of continued mutual cooperation both within countries and agencies.

159. Although there is a considerable involvement of non-governmental organizations in the carrying out of human resource development programming (out-of-school programmes, training, employment creation, cooperatives, health services, etc.), they are often excluded from the formulation of the strategies themselves. Involvement of civil society, and strengthening capacities for sharing in effective implementation of the Summit Declaration and Programme of Action, particularly among the most disadvantaged and vulnerable, is a clear priority.

160. A major inhibiting factor in operationalizing integrated human resource development has been reluctance of bureaucratic entities (ministries, agencies) to coordinate across statutory lines of responsibility. Yet as the present report has shown, several examples exist to demonstrate that in the case of human resource development policy and practice, coordination is not only required in the context of resource scarcity and increased complexity of human resource development problems, but it is also feasible.

B. Recommendations

161. The United Nations system should continue to move towards greater specificity in its definitions and conceptualization of human resource development as the keystone to empowerment in sustainable social development, and should ensure that all relevant agencies, governmental and non-governmental, are involved in that effort. Given that most of the estimated one billion poor live in rural areas, it is recommended that the Administrative Committee on Coordination Subcommittee on Rural Development - in which 31 United Nations system agencies and organizations participate - explore ways to deepen their understanding and pool their knowledge and experiences on human resource development and design mechanisms for coordination at regional and national levels.

162. While improved clarity in human resource development concepts may provide useful guidance to countries in the development of their human resource development strategies, careful recognition must be accorded to the complexities of each nation's own socio-economic, cultural and political environment. The degree and scope of cross-sectoral integration in each country will likely depend on the specific situations presented to decision makers and population, education, health, employment and other contextual considerations and needs at the time.

163. Notwithstanding the need for diversity in defining integrated human resource development strategies as a factor in each nation's own context, the shift in development paradigms towards people-centred and sustainable development necessitates renewed attention to the social, as well as the economic implications of human resource development. Thus equation of human resource development with human capital and other production factor and manpower planning approaches (including pure training for employment) must be complemented by recognition of broader psychosocial aspects of empowerment for all people.

164. It is urgent that the fundamental and unprecedented global changes taking place in the areas of employment and work, which are just beginning to be understood, be placed as a major research and policy/priority for the United Nations system. It is essential that in an era of increasing competition for limited resources, education and training efforts should have as clear and relevant information as possible on the dynamics of all kinds of livelihoods for which people are preparing themselves, particularly in view of the "informalization" of much of the economy in many countries. Better understanding is critically needed of the supply/demand relationships affecting "flows" of human resources within and across borders in order to permit more informed decisions for all relevant actors. The United Nations system and its specialized agencies, the United Nations University, the United Nations Research Institute for Social Development, and the regional commissions have unique global and regional perspectives and therefore a special contribution to draw on and synthesize individual country perspectives in this area.

165. The World Summit for Social Development has re-emphasized the importance of sectors other than social sectors (e.g. finance, trade, technology) to human resource development strategic planning, and has also recognized that many human resource development problems may be beyond the capacity of nations to solve, but may need concerted international action, such as reduction of trade barriers in a region to permit employment growth in a country. Better understanding is needed of the impacts on human resource development of national and international trade policies, industrial development policies and international financial flows.

166. It is clear that overall government frameworks are needed to provide useful structure, coordination and monitoring for national human resource development strategies. However, in view of the need to make decision-making more participatory, the focus must be sharpened on ways of involving organizations of the civil society more directly not only in delivery of services, but at all levels in social development efforts. It is now even more important that national strategies originate at, and closely involve local communities and organizations. Human resource development must not be "top down" from national capitals, but facilitatory to local implementation of what people and communities consider/decide to do best for themselves.

167. A structure for enhanced cooperation among all United Nations system actors is emerging following the World Summit. This structure relates directly to the continuum of conferences from Alma-Aty to Beijing and beyond, and has important implications for United Nations support for integrated human resource development strategies at the country level. It will be critical that the

substantive emphases of this structure be multisectoral and multidimensional in keeping with the World Summit's charge. Follow-up initiatives should be effectively linked (a) across social sectors, and with other key government sectors such as finance, trade, and industry/commerce; (b) between governmental and non-governmental and private agencies and organizations; and (c) reflective of local and community needs through a deeply decentralized functional pattern of operation.

168. Regional initiatives in assisting countries to operationalize integrated human resource development strategies should be continued, with emphasis on improving the serviceability of the concept to countries and peoples in the regions themselves. The United Nations system can support these regional efforts, both by improving linkages, in terms of direct relevance, down to country strategies, as well as providing global communication of the commonalities and differences across regions, thus providing useful contextual and comparative information to those charged with human resource development planning. Several practical functions can be served: refined definitions of the service continuum of human resource development as a cross-sectoral concept; improved system knowledge based on interregional comparison of case histories (successes and failures); and practical guidelines to assist countries in the application of those concepts in their own development programmes.

169. The World Summit places special emphasis on the social situation in Africa and the transition economies, on the needs of women and girls, as well as of the vulnerable and the disabled, and the increasing problems of ageing populations in the developing world. While each of these categories of need will be different, if overlapping, they are particularly relevant to all aspects of human resource development strategy and practice. These constituencies and needs must be given special attention by the United Nations system in assisting countries during the follow-up process to the Summit.

170. There has been a proliferation of training programmes as a human resource development response to identification of increasing skills gaps. As employment requirements become more technological and training technologies themselves more sophisticated, there may be a tendency for increased expenditures for training to become institutionalized without due and critical appraisal. Effective human resource development requires that training not just be conducted, but be considered in relation to longer-term employment and livelihood probabilities. The United Nations system should continually assess its support for training to ensure that (a) training focuses on sustainable learning of lasting benefit to those trained, and (b) is planned so as to reach substantial proportions of those in need of training.

171. The United Nations system should improve the monitoring of its own efforts and strengthen countries' abilities to monitor their own efforts to move closer towards the goals outlined in the successive General Assembly resolutions. The United Nations Statistical Commission and the Department for Economic and Social Information and Policy Analysis should take a lead in developing a common system of social development indicators, social impact assessment and performance appraisal methods.

172. Finally, for human resource development strategies to succeed, inter-agency cooperation and coordination will need a common system of social development indicators disaggregated by gender, age, disability and income, as well as greatly improved social impact assessment methods. The absence of such a common system at present complicates the monitoring and appraisal of the effects of international actions.

173. Countries and United Nations agencies should work together to identify resource and expenditure flows, not just by traditional sectors, but so as to permit identification or people-centred development costs as a proportion of total costs.

Notes

1/ Ostram, E., Schroeder, L., and Wynne, S., Institutional Incentives and Sustainable Development: Infrastructure Policies in Perspective, Westview Press, Boulder, Col., 1993.

2/ Behrman, J. R., Human Resource Led Development? Review of Issues and Evidence, ILO-ARTEP, World Employment Programme, India, 1990.

3/ Lawrence, J. E. S., "Literacy and Human Resources Development: An Integrated Approach", Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science, No. 520, March 1992, pp. 42-53; and "Human Resources Development: An Integrated Approach", Journal of Economic Cooperation among Islamic Countries, vol. 12, No. 1-2, January-April 1991, pp. 47-60.

4/ Richards, P., "Issues in Manpower Analysis", in New Approaches to Manpower Planning and Analysis, Richards, P. and Amjad, R. (eds.), ILO, Geneva, 1994.

5/ Righter, R., Utopia Lost. The United Nations and World Order, Twentieth Century Fund, New York, 1995, p. 51.

6/ Rahman, M. A., "Towards an Alternative Development Paradigm", Inaugural address at the Biennial Conference of the Bangladesh Economic Association, Dhaka, 23 November 1990.

7/ The State of the World's Children - 1995, UNICEF, Oxford University Press, New York, 1995, pp. 2 and 3.

8/ African Employment Report, ILO, Geneva, 1992.

9/ World Employment Report, ILO, Geneva, 1995, pp. 1 and 129.

10/ Ibid., p. 113.

11/ UNICEF Facts and Figures 1994-5, New York, 1995.

12/ World Education Report, UNESCO, Paris, 1993, p. 24.

13/ World Employment - 1995, ILO, Geneva, 1995.

14/ UNESCO, op. cit., p. 32.

15/ The World's Women. Trends and Statistics 1970-1990, United Nations, New York, 1991, pp. 46-48.

16/ Ibid., p. 62.

17/ Ibid., p. 63.

18/ Report on the World Social Situation, United Nations, New York, 1993, p. 118.

19/ Dikshit, P., "Proliferation of Small Arms and Minor Weapons", Asian Strategic Review, 1992-1993, pp. 205-231.

20/ World Development Report, World Bank, 1994, p. 6.

21/ Human Development Report 1994, UNDP, p. 188, table 32.

22/ Social Equity and Changing Production Patterns: An Integrated Approach, ECLAC, Santiago, 1992, p. 205.

23/ "PRODERE: Human Development in Action. The PRODERE Experience in Central America", UNDP/OPS, undated pamphlet.

24/ ECLAC, op. cit.

25/ Education and Knowledge: Basic Pillars of Changing Production Patterns with Equity, ECLAC, Santiago, 1992, p. 50.

26/ Ibid., p. 112.

27/ Social Equity ..., ECLAC, Santiago, 1992, pp. 23 and 24.

28/ Education and Knowledge ..., ECLAC, Santiago, 1992.

29/ Sewell, S. and Kelly, A., Social Problems in the Asia Pacific Region, Boolarong Publishers, Brisbane, 1991.

30/ Enhancement of Cooperation Between Governments and Non-Governmental Organizations for Human Resources Development, ESCAP/UNDP, 1991, p. 14.

31/ Ibid., p. 15.

32/ Guidelines to an Integrated Approach to Human Resources Development Policy-Making, Planning and Programming, ESCAP/UNDP, Bangkok, 1991.

33/ Annual Report 1994, World Bank, Washington, D.C., p. 119.

34/ Position paper for the World Summit for Social Development, UNESCO, 1994.

35/ The State of the World's Children - 1995, UNICEF, Oxford University Press, New York, 1995, p. 34.

36/ Ibid., p. 45.

37/ Ibid., p. 46.